

Performance and Resources Committee Meeting

Date of Meeting	Monday 9 October 2017
Paper Title	Evaluation of the Delivery of the 2016-17 Glasgow Regional Outcome Agreement
Agenda Item	6
Paper Number	PRC1-B
Responsible Officer	Robin Ashton, Executive Director
Status	Disclosable
Action	For Decision

1. Purpose of Report

- 1.1 This report provides an evaluation of progress towards the achievement of targets and goals set out within the Glasgow Regional Outcome Agreement for 2016-17 (full document available at: www.gcrb.ac.uk/publications).

2. Recommendations

- 2.1 Members are recommended to:

- **consider** and **provide feedback** on the attached draft evaluation of progress towards the achievement of targets and goals set out within the Glasgow Regional Outcome Agreement for 2016-17;
- **agree**, subject to any amendments, to the revision in light of this evaluation of two regional targets set for 2017-18; and
- **endorse** this report, subject to any amendments, to the GCRB Board for submission to the Scottish Funding Council by October 31, 2017.

3. Draft 2016-17 Glasgow Regional Outcome Agreement Evaluation

- 3.1 A draft evaluation of progress made in 2016-17 towards the achievement of 2016-17 Regional Outcome Agreement is attached at Annex A for member consideration and feedback.
- 3.2 This evaluation report is intended to provide an early opportunity for the GCRB Board to consider progress made in 2016-17 towards the achievement of 2016-17 Regional Outcome Agreement targets, and to provide an opportunity to review and where appropriate modify targets set within the 2017-18 Regional Outcome Agreement.

- 3.3** This report will be provided to the Scottish Funding Council by October 31, 2017 as required within their published Regional Outcome Agreement Guidance to enable it to contribute to SFC's monitoring processes.
- 3.4** Members should note that the quantitative analysis is based on data provided by the colleges which whilst having been prepared for internal audit, may be subject to some further change prior to finalisation and sign off to the SFC, and with respect to attainment data, this is further analysed by the SFC prior to formal publication, and may be subject to additional minor change.
- 3.5** The draft evaluation has been informed by discussions held at regional operational groups and has been influenced by related quality review and enhancement activity being led by Education Scotland. This report will be complemented by individual college Evaluative Reports and Enhancement Plans, which form part of the new quality arrangements for Scotland's Colleges and which are due to be submitted to Education Scotland and the Scottish Funding Council by October 31.
- 3.6** The attached evaluation provides evidence of significant collective progress made towards the achievement of targets contained within the 2016-17 Glasgow Regional Outcome Agreement, and in particular:
- delivery to target by all three colleges of core and additional European Social Funded provision;
 - evidence of coherent delivery of curriculum related to identified regional and national economic needs;
 - evidence that the region as a whole has prioritised the delivery which widens access and the region has exceeded its performance targets related to this;
 - leaver destination data shows high proportions of learners moving on to positive post course destinations; and
 - significant expansion of *Developing the Young Workforce* school/college partnership activity, both in terms of the volume and the range of college learning opportunities offered to Senior Phase pupils.

However, the following are identified as areas for improvement:

- reduced rates of attainment in full-time courses, particularly at Further Education levels; and
- low levels of inter-region progression to evidence a coherent and joined up regional curriculum offer.

These areas for improvement will be addressed through Education Scotland endorsed college enhancement plans for 2017-18.

4. Link to the New Quality Arrangements for Scotland's Colleges

- 4.1** In December 2016 the Scottish Funding Council and Education Scotland introduced new arrangements for assuring the quality of learning and teaching in Scotland's colleges.
- 4.2** The full new quality evaluation framework, '*How Good is Our College?*' provides a suite of quality indicators for colleges, their stakeholders, partners and learners to self-evaluate their college's provision and outcomes and to plan for improvement. The full '*How Good is Our College?*' framework document can be found on the Education Scotland website at: <https://education.gov.scot/improvement/Pages/frwk18-hgiocollege.aspx>
- 4.3** It is recognised by SFC and Education Scotland that 2016-17 is a 'year of development' during which colleges, regional bodies, SFC and Education Scotland will learn whilst implementing the new arrangements and make adjustments for future years. Over the past academic year, the GCRB Performance and Resources Committee has received reports on progress to implement the new arrangements.
- 4.4** The new arrangements seek to integrate quality arrangements with outcome agreement evaluation and reporting. Whilst in single college regions, it is envisaged that a single, combined evaluation report will therefore be produced, it is recognised by Education Scotland and the SFC that in multi-college regions, assigned colleges will produce their own individual Evaluative Reports and Enhancement Plans (and grades) and that multi-college regional bodies will continue to produce a regional summary of progress against outcome agreement measures and targets.
- 4.5** Members should note however that this evaluation of progress has been informed by the individual draft college evaluation reports and enhancement plans and that these college level documents will be provided to the GCRB Board for noting following planned Education Scotland independent scrutiny and endorsement meetings in November 2017.
- 4.6** These meetings will be convened by Education Scotland in November 2017 to formally endorse, or not endorse that:
- the Evaluative Report provides an accurate and appropriate account of the quality of provision, services and outcomes being delivered by the college; and
 - the Enhancement Plan is well-informed by and linked appropriately to the findings of the ER, and communicates clearly plans to address areas of provision, services and outcomes which require improvement.
- 4.7** In the event of Education Scotland not endorsing a college report or plan, sector guidance suggests that there would be a process implemented whereby the college, Education Scotland, SFC and the regional strategic body would work together to take appropriate action to address identified needs with a view to enabling the report to be endorsed.

4.8 In December 2017, Education Scotland and SFC will publish college reports with accompanying endorsement statements on their websites. Grading outcomes for 2016-17 will not be published.

4.9 A diagram setting out planned activities and reporting timescales for GCRB and the Glasgow colleges is set out within Annex A.

5. Risk Analysis

5.1 The process undertaken to develop this evaluation addresses *GCRB Risk 005: A failure to effectively plan/monitor our educational delivery results in the curriculum not meeting regional economic and social needs.*

5.2 The achievement overall of the majority of ROA targets provides evidence that risks related to *GCRB Risk 008: Failure to achieve the targets set out in the Regional Outcome Agreement lessens our ability to meet regional needs* have reduced.

5.3 However, the dip in attainment levels suggests an increased likelihood for *GCRB Risk 006: The quality of learning and teaching falls and fewer learners achieving positive outcomes.* College Enhancement Plans will seek to mitigate this increased likelihood.

6. Legal Implications

6.1 No legal implications are identified.

7. Resource Implications

7.1 No significant resource implications are identified.

8. Strategic Plan Implications

8.1 The curriculum delivery funded through Regional Outcome Agreements directly underpins the regional strategic ambition to build Scotland's most inclusive, most responsive and most effective regional college system. The evidence outlined within the evaluation report suggests significant progress is being made towards achieving this ambition.

Annex A: Evaluation of the Delivery of the 2016-17 Glasgow Regional Outcome Agreement

1. Evaluation of the Achievement of Curriculum Delivery Targets

The table below sets out regional curriculum volumes delivered by type in relation to outcome agreement targets.

Volume of core credits and ESF credits and activity by economic sector

Curriculum Type:	Target	Actual	Variance	% from target
Core credits	368,574	370,893	2,319	0.6%
ESF credits	17,848	18,777	929	5.2%
Total credits	386,422	389,670	3,248	0.8%
Administration, Financial & Business Services	80,537	78,543	-1,994	-2.5%
Creative and Cultural Industries	59,216	60,899	1,683	2.8%
Engineering, Construction & Manufacturing	74,947	72,526	-2,421	-3.2%
Food, Drink, Tourism, Hospitality and Leisure	67,404	66,100	-1,304	-1.9%
Health, Care and Education	38,703	38,082	-621	-1.6%
Land-Based Industries	2,828	2,591	-237	-8.4%
Life and Chemical Sciences	12,385	12,370	-15	-0.1%
Transition and Supported Learning	50,403	58,559	8,156	16.2%

The table above shows that the region met its overall Credit targets for core and ESF funded activity, with a cumulative over-delivery of 3,248 Credits equating to 0.8% over target. **This represents excellent regional performance**, particularly given that the target for 2016-17 was approximately 1,000 Credits higher than that delivered in 2015-16 and in a context of reported reduced national demand for college places. In addition, for 2016-17 significant volumes of curriculum were transferred across the three Glasgow colleges as part of the regional curriculum and estates plan. In summary this amounted to Glasgow Kelvin College and Glasgow Clyde College reducing core activity with the majority of this activity (both curriculum and related staff) transferring to the City of Glasgow College. This presented significant financial and planning challenges for the Glasgow colleges but, in terms of providing the right learning in the right place, these curriculum transfers allowed Glasgow Kelvin College to permanently close its City Campus, the oldest and poorest quality building within the Glasgow college estate.

In addition to delivering main grant funded activity, in 2016/17 the Glasgow colleges successfully delivered additional learning opportunities equivalent to over 18,000 Credits as part of the second year of a three-year SFC led, European Social Fund Youth Employment Initiative project.

In terms of activity related to economic sectors, over 2016-17 there was continual review in partnership with stakeholders of evidence related to the alignment of the curriculum to the social and economic needs of the region. This work included reviewing information relating to national and regional developments such as the new Glasgow Regional Skills Assessment for 2016/17, the Glasgow Economic Strategy 2016-2023, the Scottish Government commitment to increasing childcare provision, the national STEM strategy consultation, the draft City Deal strategy, and

demand for ESOL across the Glasgow College region, and comparing this to data on current and planned college delivery.

Given the extent of variables which could impact on achievement of the regional economic sector Credit targets, **very good regional progress has been made** in respect of delivery to targets. The main variances (over 1,000 Credits from target) are:

- Significant delivery over target (+8,156 Credits) for the Transition and Supported Learning sector – college evaluation suggests that this is due to increasing volumes of widening access activities reflected in the substantial increase in delivery to SIMD10 learners and the delivery of SCQF levels 1-6 provision.
- Delivery over target (+1,683 Credits) for the Creative and Cultural Industries sector – college evaluation suggests that this is due to continuing strong student demand and management of risks relating to the meeting of overall activity targets and efficient staff utilisation.
- Delivery under target (-2,421 Credits) for the Engineering, Construction & Manufacturing sector – college evaluation suggests that this is due to a slight reduction in the volume of employed learners supported by industry and also a growth in the number of HN Engineering students who are now funded through additional articulation places with local universities.
- Delivery under target (-1,994 Credits) for the Administration, Financial & Business Services sector – college evaluation suggests that this is due to under recruitment in some Administration and Computing programmes.
- Delivery under target (-1,304 Credits) for the Food, Drink, Tourism, Hospitality and Leisure sector – college evaluation suggests that this is due to under recruitment in some Hospitality and Events programmes and the re-profiling of some provision in this area as access level provision, which moved the programmes to the Transition and Supported Learning sector.

In terms of impact of this evaluation on future regional curriculum plans, work is currently underway to review economic development trends and labour market information to support the development of refreshed regional curriculum plans for 2018-19 onwards. Regional curriculum hubs formed of curriculum leads relating to each of the economic sectors specified above are initiating this work and will integrate the evaluations set out within this report into their considerations.

2. Evaluation of the Achievement of Widening Access Targets

Two key performance measures are used to evaluate regional progress towards ensuring that learning opportunities are accessible, supportive and representative of all:

- volume of Credits delivered to residents from postcodes classed within the 10% most deprived in Scotland, recognising that around 1/3 of Glasgow households fall within this category; and
- volume of Credits delivered at Further Education levels, directly addressing the significantly high levels of residents in Glasgow with low or no qualifications.

The table below shows curriculum volumes for 2016-17, with respect to these two measures.

Credit Levels for SIMD10 and SCQF Levels 1-6

Measure	Target	Actual	Variance	% from target
Credits delivered to SIMD10 learners	110,356	117,768	7,412	6.7%
Credits delivered at SCQF levels 1 to 6	212,434	213,368	934	0.4%

The data above provides evidence of very good progress to target and positive action taken to addressing a priority development area for the Glasgow Region as a whole.

In terms of the SIMD10 target, it should be noted that the method of calculation was changed mid-year to align with the SFC reporting and this increased the reported volume by an estimated 3,000 – 4,000 Credits. However, notwithstanding this, the data above suggests that the region as a whole has exceeded both the widening access targets set for 2016-17, and **this is particularly impressive** given that in 2015-16 more limited progress was made with respect to target achievement and considerable regional focus was placed on addressing widening access as a regional priority.

In support of the regional commitment to widening access and in line with new SFC ROA requirements, over the course of 2016-17, the three Glasgow Colleges developed institutional Access and Inclusion Strategies and Gender Action Plans. These align to ROA targets and provide forward looking action plans to continue to support increased representation of priority groups. In addition, over the year, college equality managers regularly met to share practice with respect to college level equalities activity, including development of college level equality mainstreaming reports.

3. Evaluation of the Achievement of Attainment Targets

The table below sets out attainment data for 2016-17, and compares this to both target data and 2015-16 benchmarks.

Percentage Successful Attainment Rates

Cohort:	2016/17 Target	2016/17 Actual	Variance from target	2015/16 Actual	Change from 2015/16
Full-time Further Education % Successful	68.6%	64.6%	-4.0%	67.2%	-2.6%
Part-time Further Education % Successful	76.6%	78.8%	2.2%	79.5%	-0.7%
Full-time Higher Education % Successful	74.1%	72.9%	-1.2%	74.6%	-1.7%
Part-time Higher Education % Successful	82.4%	81.9%	-0.5%	79.0%	2.9%
All Learners % Successful	(no target)	74.5%		75.6%	-1.1%

With respect to the above data, it should be noted that performance data in relation to attainment rates tends to be refined by SFC so that the final published data may differ from the data analysed at this stage of the academic year.

The data provided shows that the region has not met its targets for full-time attainment rates. Following several years of consecutive increase (with for example the targets for 2015-16 being

exceeded), the full-time figures for 2016-17 **represent a dip in regional performance**. College level evaluation suggests that a significant contributory factor to this was the impact of industrial action taken in 2016/17 (where learners lost up to six days of tuition in the final teaching block) and in particular on full-time Further Education programmes where a significant proportion of learners reside in the 10% lowest SIMD areas, and which therefore includes a higher proportion of vulnerable learners with more significant support needs. However, members should note that further, more detailed evaluation of these attainment levels, including analysis of retention, will be provided within individual college evaluative reports.

Across part time provision, success rates were either above or broadly in line with the targets set in the ROA.

Overall, notwithstanding the disappointing drop in full-time attainment, across all provision, attainment fell by around 1% compared to the previous year with just under three quarters of learners successfully completing their course of study which in a national context **still represents very good performance** (the comparator figure for Scotland in 2015-16 was 72% successful attainment across all learners).

4. Evaluation of Post Course Destination Data

A significant aspect of regionalisation and the development of outcome agreements, has been a stronger focus on the positive effects of college learning on the lives of learners. Post-course destination data provides a key measure of the impact of undertaking a college course and is now included in the Scottish Funding Council’s list of 13 national sector measures.

Members should note that this performance measure does not take account of the significant volume of part-time learners who progress directly to employment, such as those undertaking apprenticeships.

The table below shows data collected for Glasgow region full-time qualifiers, 3-6 months after the course end for 2015-16 leavers, with comparator data for 2014-15.

Glasgow Region Positive Post-Course Destination Rates for 2015-16 qualifiers

Measure:	2015-16 Target	2015-16 Actual	Variance from target	2014-15 Actual
% of full-time college qualifiers in work, training and/or further study after 3-6 months	96.7%	96.8%	0.1%	97.5%
Response rate for post-course destination survey respondents	81.0%	85.6%	4.6%	87.5%

The post course progression data for the 2015-16 leaver cohort shows that the levels for both post course success and for response rate **has fallen slightly** from levels achieved for the 2014-15 leaver cohort, but continue to exceed the 3-year targets set for the Regional Outcome Agreement.

In addition, the table below shows that the levels of qualifiers progressing to a positive destination in Glasgow exceed national average levels for the same year (albeit the response rate for Glasgow is slightly lower than across Scotland as a whole).

National and Regional Positive Post-Course Destination Rates for 2015-16 qualifiers

Measure:	2015-16 Scotland national average	2015-16 Glasgow	Variance from national average	2014-15 Actual
% of full-time college qualifiers in work, training and/or further study after 3-6 months	94.9%	96.8%	2.1%	97.5%
Response rate for post-course destination survey respondents	87.2%	85.6%	-1.6%	87.5%

The table below provides a further breakdown of the 2015-16 leaver cohort, showing data for Further Education level qualifiers (SCQF levels 1-6) and Higher Education level learners, with a comparison to national averages.

Primary Destinations of FE and HE Level Qualifiers

	Further Education	Higher Education	All qualifiers	Scotland Average
Destination not known	12%	18%	14%	13%
Further study	76%	59%	68%	66%
Working	10%	20%	15%	17%
Not working	2%	3%	3%	4%

The table below shows a classification by industry type of the 1,640 qualifiers progressing to employment. The largest volume of learners progress to Professional, scientific and technical activities and this includes a large number of nautical study related employers.

Classification by Industry of those who Progressed to Employment

Industry Classification	Number	Proportion
Professional, scientific and technical activities	279	17%
Arts, entertainment and recreation	203	12%
Activities of extraterritorial organisations and bodies	178	11%
Human health and social work activities	164	10%
Wholesale and retail trade; repair of motor vehicles and motorcycles	155	9%
Accommodation and food service activities	125	8%
Other service activities	121	7%
Construction	79	5%
Transport and storage	51	3%
Education	51	3%
Electricity, gas, steam and air conditioning supply	50	3%
Manufacturing	45	3%
Administrative and support service activities	33	2%
Public administration and defence; compulsory social security	32	2%
Financial and insurance activities	31	2%
Information and communication	29	2%
Water supply, sewerage, waste management and remediation activities	14	1%

In terms of progression to further study, similar volumes of learners progressed from 2015-16 as did in 2014-15 (approximately 7,500 of the 11,000 leavers).

Members will recall that as part of implementation work related to the Glasgow Region Strategic Plan for College Education, an agreed key objective is to improve the ease and equity with which learners can progress through their learning, with all learners supported to access to the full range of courses within the regional college system, increasing the proportion of students moving from college to college. The data for 2015-16 leavers suggests that the majority (approximately 65%) of these qualifiers progressed to further study within their own college, with **levels of progression between the colleges within the Glasgow Region remaining low** (at 3%, similar to 2014-15 data) and with around 7% of all Further Education Leavers moving to another college within the region.

Levels of progression to university for the 2015-16 cohort also remained consistent with 2014-15 data and the table below provides data on destinations for universities where more than 30 qualifiers progressed, with a comparison with similar data for 2014-15 qualifiers.

University	Number of 2015-16 qualifiers progressing	Number of 2014-15 qualifiers progressing
Glasgow Caledonian University	858	846
The University of West Of Scotland	508	516
The University of Strathclyde,	258	283
The University of Glasgow	148	113
Edinburgh Napier University	87	156
Heriot-Watt University	79	85
The University Of Stirling,	78	50
The University Of Dundee	69	93
Glasgow School Of Art	49	52
Robert Gordon University	39	32
Queen Margaret University	30	39

5. Evaluation of the Delivery of Developing the Young Workforce (DYW) Commitments

In support of the priorities set out within Scotland's Youth Employment Strategy (Scottish Government, 2014), the region collectively continues to prioritise the strengthening of vocational progression partnership activity with schools, universities and employers.

Building on the Developing the Young Workforce Early Adopter success, the colleges introduced more study opportunities for school pupils at each college. Overall, in 2016/17 the Glasgow colleges delivered a 22% increase in the number of senior phase vocational pathways for their three main local authority partners (up to 155 programmes from 127 in 2015/16) with pupil numbers increasing from around 2,300 to over 2,700 an increase of approximately 17% in school pupil engagement, as well as an increase in choice, **which represents excellent progress**.

Colleges also increased the scope and extent of early intervention activity with schools. This included significant primary and secondary school taster programmes, attendance at S2 option

choice information evenings (a crucial moment where senior phase pathways are determined for school pupils), lectures in partnership with the Glasgow Science Centre, online initiatives and classroom activities for use at S2 level in schools.

A successful regional vocational options day for Glasgow schools was held to showcase vocational options at all three colleges to young people and their parents and guardians. The three colleges also collaborated on a single presentation all secondary school head teachers at three locations in the city, which outlined ways in which the FE service in Glasgow could help schools meet their DYW obligations. The colleges also delivered increasing volumes of Modern Apprenticeship provision, and participated in project Search which delivers work-based learning to young people with additional support needs and in FOCUS West activities for S5 and S6.

To support further expansion of Developing the Young Workforce activity in 2016/17 a single regional bid was approved by Skills Development Scotland to deliver a Foundation Apprenticeships (FA) programme encompassing all available frameworks (Engineering, Construction, Social Services and Healthcare, Financial Services, Children and Young People and Computing), delivering one of the largest Foundation Apprenticeship programmes available in Scotland. This ensured all S5 students across the three local authority areas of Glasgow, East Dunbartonshire and East Renfrewshire had access to a broad range of courses which both provided opportunities for Senior Phase pupils to gain industry recognised qualifications, and for the region as a whole to address skills gaps in growing sectors of the regional economy. School pupils from North Lanarkshire were also given access to this opportunity because there was no FA provision for them in 2016-17 being delivered in their region.

In session 2016-17, 78 students began their Foundation Apprenticeship in Glasgow in 2016 with 69% confirmed as continuing on to study in 2017-18 and a further 9% progressing directly to a Modern Apprenticeship before completing the programme. By July 2017, 240 employers had expressed interest in offering FA placements including BBC Scotland, Balfour Beatty, RBS, Celtic FC, JP Morgan and Hewlett Packard.

Looking forwards, a second FA bid for 2017-19 was also successful, securing up to 248 places on FA programmes for the region. Most of these places are already filled which has increased uptake of FAs in Glasgow by 300%. This new contract model however removes FAs from credit funding, with all funding drawn down from SDS. The FA team and the collegiate project were subsequently nominated for awards at the Inspiring City Awards and the Glasgow Business Awards, both supported by the Glasgow Chamber of Commerce.

In summary, given the timescales and the early stage of Foundation Apprenticeship delivery, **significant regional progress has been made** to establish this new type of Senior Phase programme.

6. Review of 2017-18 Targets

The SFC ROA evaluation guidance states that it should consider any rationale for changes to targets in the draft outcome agreement.

Following review and discussion of 2017-18 ROA targets in the context of 2016-17 evaluation data at regional operational groups, it is proposed that two regional targets are revised to provide a more appropriate measure of success. These are:

- The Credit target for Transitions and Supported Learning curriculum activity - Glasgow Kelvin College delivered a level of activity significantly over target due to it increasing activity related to widening access. It is proposed that the college (and therefore the region) increase the target for Credit activity related to this sector by approximately 2,500 Credits to 15,000 Credits, with a cumulative equal reduction across other areas of curriculum delivery.
- The Credit target for Further Education level delivery – due to student demand, City of Glasgow College delivered less Further Education level activity than anticipated in 2016-17. With further growth planned for 2017-18 for City of Glasgow College (both in terms of overall Credits and in terms of Further Education level delivery), it is proposed that the college target for Further Education level delivery is reduced from 8,000 Credits to 3,000 Credits (making an overall college target 75,000 Credits).

Significant work is currently underway to review the curriculum offer for 2018-19 and beyond and to refresh the curriculum plans set out in 2015 as part of the regional Curriculum and Estates Plan. This will provide a more significant opportunity to review evidence of economic and social need and the appropriateness of related regional curriculum targets (including economic sector and Further Education level Credit targets), particularly in light of the expected reduction in ESF funding.

Annex B: Planned 2017-18 Schedule of Quality Activity within the Glasgow College Region

