

## Nominations and Remuneration Committee Meeting

Date of Meeting	Monday 5 October 2015
Paper Title	Board evaluation, member appraisal and board training
Agenda Item	9
Paper Number	NRC2-D
Responsible Officer	Martin Fairbairn, Interim Chief Officer
Status	Disclosable
Action	For Approval

### 1. Report Purpose

- 1.1. Consideration of the processes for whole-board evaluation, individual member appraisal and board training.

### 2. Recommendations

- 2.1. The Committee is invited to **agree** to the process proposed below for board evaluation.
- 2.2. The Committee is invited to **recommend** to the Board the processes described below for appraisal of the Interim Chair, appraisal of committee chairs and appraisal of individual members.
- 2.3. The Committee is also invited to **identify** one of its members to:
- Chair the board self-evaluation discussion at the relevant Board meeting;
  - Conduct an appraisal-style discussion with the Interim Chair.
- 2.4. The Committee is invited to **note** that board training requirements will be identified through the proposed self-evaluation survey.

### 3. Background

#### *Committee terms of reference*

- 3.1. The Committee's terms of reference states:
- The Committee is responsible for ensuring that the Board reviews its effectiveness annually;
  - The Committee shall make recommendations to the Board in relation to a process for evaluating the effectiveness of the board chair and the committee chairs;

### ***Existing appraisal and evaluation processes***

**3.2.** As part of her introductory meetings with Board members, the Interim Chair conducted brief appraisals with each member. No other appraisals or evaluations have taken place.

#### **4. Board effectiveness review**

**4.1.** The foundation of board effectiveness reviews is normally a survey of board members themselves. Such a survey will be issued to Board members covering the topics set out in Annex A.

**4.2.** The responses will be analysed and the report will form the foundation of a self-evaluation discussion at a Board meeting.

**4.3.** It is proposed that the Board discussion is led by one of the members of the Nominations & Remuneration Committee.

#### **5. Appraisal of the Interim Chair**

**5.1.** Since the Chair of GCRB is a Ministerial appointment, formal appraisal of the Interim Chair is performed by the Scottish Government. However, it is good practice that feedback is provided from the Board as a whole on its perception of the Interim Chair's performance. It is proposed that:

- Other Board members complete a specific section of the survey on the Chair's performance;
- That feedback is collated by GCRB management and is shared with one of the members of the Nominations & Remuneration Committee and the Interim Chair;
- That member subsequently meets the Interim Chair to discuss the collated feedback;
- The Interim Chair provides a copy of that document to the Scottish Government for use in the formal appraisal.

#### **6. Appraisal of individual members**

**6.1.** As already noted, a brief appraisal of each member was conducted by the Interim Chair with each member after she took up post. The key components were:

- Each member was asked to complete a brief self-appraisal prior to the meeting;
- A meeting was held between the Interim Chair and the member during which key points were discussed and any relevant actions agreed;
- After the meeting, the Interim Chair will share her draft appraisal with the member and the appraisal will be signed by both the member and the Interim Chair.

**6.2.** It is proposed that we continue to operate a similar process on an annual basis.

## **7. Appraisal of committee chairs**

**7.1.** Primarily to inform the Board Chair's appraisal of members who are Committee chairs, it is proposed that:

- As part of their own annual self-evaluation, committees hold a discussion without their Chair present to allow consideration of the Committee Chair's performance;
- A member of the Committee meets with the Committee Chair to discuss the Committee's observations, which the Committee Chair in turn relays to the Board Chair and which is taken into account in the Board Chair's appraisal of the Committee Chair.

## **8. Board training**

**8.1.** Since GCRB's establishment, the following training and development has taken place in which at least some members have participated:

- Presentation from Glasgow City Council – May 2014 Board meeting;
- Presentation from College Principals – May 2014 Board meeting;
- Tour of college campuses by College Depute Principals – June 2014;
- Presentation from Skills Development Scotland – August 2014 Board meeting;
- Regional Outcome Agreement Session delivered by SFC – November 2014;
- Glasgow Governance Conference – December 2014;
- Health and Safety – set up Glasgow Clyde College – February 2015;
- New Funding Methodology – set up by Glasgow Clyde College – March 2015
- Colleges Development Network Board Member Event – June 2015

**8.2.** No individual development activity has taken place that is specific to GCRB.

**8.3.** Based on typical development requirements for boards and taking account of GCRB's stage of development, the following are suggested as possible topics relevant to most members (in addition to individual requirements):

- Current key issues in the college sector (with input from Colleges Scotland);
- Perspectives on the college sector in Glasgow from key stakeholders;
- Code of Conduct (possibly led by someone from the office of the Commissioner for Ethical Standards);

**8.4.** These will be tested as part of the Board self-evaluation.

**9. Risk Analysis**

**9.1.** This paper addresses the risk that the Board does not provide effective support for and challenge to GCRB.

**10. Legal Implications**

**10.1.** There are no specific legal implications arising from this paper.

**11. Financial Implications**

**11.1.** There are no new financial implications arising from this paper.

**12. Regional Outcome Agreement Implications**

**12.1.** There are no specific implications for the Regional Outcome Agreement associated with this paper.

## **Annex A – Topics for Board member self-evaluation survey**

### **Draft Board member survey questions**

#### **Board meetings**

- Frequency of Board meetings;
- Level of influence on the agenda;
- Timing of distribution of papers;
- Members' participation in meetings;
- Overall effectiveness of meetings;
- Quality and quantity of information provided to members to aid effective discussion and decision-making;
- Other comments.

#### **Committees**

- If you are a member of a committee(s), do you feel the committee(s) is effective;
- Other comments.

#### **Chair**

- Effective leadership of the Board;
- Representation of GCRB to key stakeholders;
- Chairing of the meetings of the Board;
- Adherence to the principles of public life;
- Other comments.

#### **Board membership and development**

- Balance in skills and experience of members;
- Induction arrangements for new members;
- Ongoing development;
- Suggestions for specific development requirements for the whole Board, including:
  - Current key issues in the college sector (with input from Colleges Scotland);
  - Perspectives on the college sector in Glasgow from key stakeholders;
  - Code of Conduct (possibly led by someone from the office of the Commissioner for Ethical Standards);
- Suggestions for the member's own development;
- Other comments.

#### **Stakeholders**

- Interaction with the assigned colleges;
- Access to stakeholders' views for the purposes of developing coherent strategies and policies;
- Provision of information on the strategic priorities of the Scottish Funding Council and Scottish Government to inform decision-making;
- Provision of information about strategic priorities of other stakeholder bodies which inform decision-making;

- Other comments.

### **GCRB management**

- How do you rate the efficiency and effectiveness of GCRB management in serving the Board;
- Other comments.

### **GCRB's effectiveness as a corporate body**

- How do you rate the effectiveness of the Board as a corporate body, taking into account the Code of Good Governance for Scotland's Colleges?